The Energy Commission staff believes that the direct impacts associated with visual resources and the cumulative impacts associated with land use, traffic and transportation, and visual resources of the Ivanpah Solar Electric Generating System (ISEGS) project will be significant. There is no feasible mitigation that would reduce the impacts to a level that is less than significant given the scale of the project and its location.

Notwithstanding the unmitigable impacts, consideration needs to be given to the fact that the project is a solar power plant that will help California meet its renewable portfolio standard (RPS) of 33 percent in 2020 and AB 32 greenhouse gas emission reduction goals. As such, it will provide critical environmental benefits by helping the state reduce its greenhouse gas emissions, and these positive attributes must be weighed against the project’s adverse impacts. It is because of these benefits and the concerns regarding the adverse impacts that global warming will have upon the state and our environment, including desert ecosystems, that staff believes it would be appropriate for the Commission to approve the project based on a finding of overriding considerations, consistent with CEQA Guideline Section 15093 and section 1755 of the Commission’s siting regulations, if the Commission adopts staff’s proposed mitigation measures/conditions of certification.

Staff’s position on the ISEGS project should not be read as a blanket endorsement of all solar projects nor as an indication that we will consistently conclude that it is appropriate for the Commission to adopt overriding considerations for unmitigable significant environmental impacts. Our determinations will be made on a case-by-case basis. As with all electricity infrastructure projects, site selection is a critical factor in determining impacts and staff’s position on whether a Commission override is appropriate or warranted. The fact that the ISEGS project’s site is adjacent to, and in the vicinity of, extensive development, (e.g., a golf course, Interstate 15, casinos, and existing electricity infrastructure, including major transmission lines and another power plant), is
a significant factor in reaching the conclusion that an override is appropriate in this case. The staff may not support an override for a project in a more remote location. As indicated in its November 19, 2008 Renewable Energy Transmission Initiative comments on the proposed competitive renewable energy zones, staff believes renewable energy development should occur in areas proximate to “existing transmission infrastructure and load centers” and recognizes that it is important to “protect the unique visual resources of the desert and to preserve the special qualities of remoteness and isolation that are inherent in the appeal of desert landscapes.”

One final observation is that, in the future, after several of the new solar power plants have been constructed and have been operational for an appropriate period of time, staff and others will have more information about their collective impacts to evaluate and compare the characteristics of the various solar thermal technologies. Based upon this information, staff will be better informed to determine whether some technologies are preferable from an environmental perspective and will factor that evaluation into our alternatives analysis. Important issues to analyze will include water use, land use (amount of land needed per megawatt of generating capacity), visual impacts, and ground disturbance.

In support of staff’s position for consideration by the Committee, staff requests that notice is taken of the following documents:


3) Integration of Renewable Resources. CAISO, Nov. 2007.


APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATION
FOR THE IVANPAH SOLAR ELECTRIC
GENERATING SYSTEM

APPLICANT
Solar Partners, LLC
John Woolard,
Chief Executive Officer
1999 Harrison Street, Suite #500
Oakland, CA 94612

Todd A. Stewart, Project Manager
Ivanpah SEG
sdeyoung@brightsourceenergy.com

APPLICANT’S CONSULTANTS
John L. Carrier, J. D.
2485 Natomas Park Dr. #600
Sacramento, CA 95833-2937
jcarrier@ch2m.com

COUNSEL FOR APPLICANT
Jeffery D. Harris
Ellison, Schneider & Harris L.L.P.
2600 Capitol Avenue, Ste. 400
Sacramento, CA 95816-5905
jdh@eslawfirm.com

INTERESTED AGENCIES
California ISO
e-recipient@caiso.com

Tom Hurshman,
Project Manager
Bureau of Land Management
2465 South Townsend Ave.
Montrose, CO 81401
tom_hurshman@blm.gov

APPLICANT
Solar Partners, LLC
John Woolard,
Chief Executive Officer
1999 Harrison Street, Suite #500
Oakland, CA 94612

Todd A. Stewart, Project Manager
Ivanpah SEG
sdeyoung@brightsourceenergy.com

APPLICATION FOR CERTIFICATION
FOR THE IVANPAH SOLAR ELECTRIC
GENERATING SYSTEM

DOCKET NO. 07-AFC-5
PROOF OF SERVICE
(Revised 3/11/10)

Raymond C. Lee, Field Manager
Bureau of Land Management
1303 South U.S. Highway 95
Needles, CA 92363
Raymond_Lee@ca.blm.gov

Becky Jones
California Department of
Fish & Game
36431 41st Street East
Palmdale, CA 93552
dfpalm@adelphia.net

INTERVENORS
California Unions for Reliable Energy (“CURE”)
c/o: Tanya A. Gulesserian
Marc D. Joseph
Adams Broadwell Joseph & Cardozo
601 Gateway Boulevard, Ste 1000
South San Francisco, CA 94080
tgulesserian@adamsbroadwell.com

Western Watersheds Project
Michael J. Connor, Ph.D.
P.O. Box 2364
Reseda, CA 91337-2364
mjconnor@westernwatersheds.org

Gloria Smith, Joanne Spalding
Sidney Silliman, Devorah Ancel
Sierra Club
85 Second Street, 2nd Fl.
San Francisco, CA 94105
E-mail Service Preferred
gloria.smith@sierraclub.org
joanne.spalding@sierraclub.org
gsilliman@csupomona.edu
deverah.ancel@sierraclub.org

*indicates change
INTERVENORS CONT.
Joshua Basofin, CA Rep.
Defenders of Wildlife
1303 J Street, Ste. 270
Sacramento, CA 95814
E-mail Service Preferred
jbasofin@defenders.org

Basin and Range Watch
Laura Cunningham
Kevin Emmerich
P.O. Box 70
Beatty, NV 89003
atomictoadranch@netzero.net

Center for Biological Diversity
Lisa T. Belenky, Sr. Attorney
Ileene Anderson, Public Lands Desert Director
351 California Street, Ste. 600
San Francisco, CA 94104
E-mail Service Preferred
lbelenky@biologicaldiversity.org
ianderson@biologicaldiversity.org

California Native Plant Society
Greg Suba, Tara Hansen & Jim Andre
2707 K Street, Suite 1
Sacramento, California, 95816-5113
E-mail Service Preferred
gsuba@cnps.org
thansen@cnps.org
granites@telis.org

County of San Bernardino
Bart W. Brizzee, Deputy Co. Counsel
385 N. Arrowhead Avenue, 4th Fl.
San Bernardino, California, 92415
bbrizzee@cc.sbcounty.gov

ENERGY COMMISSION
JEFFREY D. BYRON
Commissioner and Presiding Member
jbyron@energy.state.ca.us

JAMES D. BOYD
Vice Chairman and
Associate Member
jboyd@energy.state.ca.us

Paul Kramer
Hearing Officer
pkramer@energy.state.ca.us

John Kessler
Project Manager
jkessler@energy.state.ca.us

Dick Ratliff
Staff Counsel
dratliff@energy.state.ca.us

Jennifer Jennings
Public Adviser
publicadviser@energy.state.ca.us

*indicates change
DECLARATION OF SERVICE

I, Maria Santourdjian, declare that on March 17, 2010, I served and filed copies of the attached, Staff's Comments Regarding a Possible Energy Commission Finding of Overriding Considerations, dated March 16, 2010. The original document, filed with the Docket Unit, is accompanied by a copy of the most recent Proof of Service list, located on the web page for this project at: [www.energy.ca.gov/sitingcases/ivanpah].

The documents have been sent to both the other parties in this proceeding (as shown on the Proof of Service list) and to the Commission's Docket Unit, in the following manner:

(Check all that Apply)

FOR SERVICE TO ALL OTHER PARTIES:

- x sent electronically to all email addresses on the Proof of Service list;
- x by personal delivery;
- x by delivering on this date, for mailing with the United States Postal Service with first-class postage thereon fully prepaid, to the name and address of the person served, for mailing that same day in the ordinary course of business; that the envelope was sealed and placed for collection and mailing on that date to those addresses NOT marked "email preferred."

AND

FOR FILING WITH THE ENERGY COMMISSION:

- x sending an original paper copy and one electronic copy, mailed and emailed respectively, to the address below (preferred method);

OR

- ___ depositing in the mail an original and 12 paper copies, as follows:

   CALIFORNIA ENERGY COMMISSION
   Attn: Docket No. 07-AFC-5
   1516 Ninth Street, MS-4
   Sacramento, CA 95814-5512
docket@energy.state.ca.us

I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct, that I am employed in the county where this mailing occurred, and that I am over the age of 18 years and not a party to the proceeding.

Originally Signed by       
Maria Santourdjian

*indicates change